

Modernization and Reforms:

Towards Representative Models of
Journalists' Unions, Associations and
Press Clubs in Pakistan



Modernization and Reforms:

Towards Representative Models of Journalists' Unions, Associations and Press Clubs in Pakistan

*Challenges and Solutions of Promoting Labour Rights,
Gender Equality and Freedom of Association in
Pakistan's Shifting Media Landscape*

This research report is part of an IFJ-NED Project

This baseline research is part of a rapid assessment of the key factors preventing media unions in Pakistan accepting the growing number of young journalists, particularly digital and women media practitioners, as members and defending their labour rights.

July 2021

**Author and Lead Researcher: Adnan Rehmat
Implementation Partner: Freedom Network**



Table of Contents

1. SUMMARY	06
2. Rapid Assessment: Research Objectives	07
3. Methodology	08
4. Surveys	09
4. Data and Analysis	10
5. PART A: PROBLEMS	12
6. Category 1: Digital journalists	13
7. Category 2: Women journalist	16
8. Category 3: Digital journalism platforms	19
9. Category 4: Journalists' unions, media workers' associations, press clubs	23
10. PART B: SOLUTIONS	30
11. Recommendations and action plan	31

Summary

In the face of increasingly precarious and deteriorating work conditions for journalists and media industry in Pakistan, the need to protect, uphold and advocate for the rights of all journalists is nevermore important. This project is led by the International Federation of Journalists (IFJ) as well as other stakeholders engaged through the course of the project. It aims to strengthen the capacity, confidence and strategic networking of journalists' representative organisations and press clubs, as well as representatives from mainstream, freelance and entrepreneurial media to devise a national approach to a decent work agenda and gender equity for Pakistan's media.



Rapid Assessment: Research Objectives

As part of its project with National Endowment for Democracy (NED), this IFJ research aimed to undertake a rapid assessment of the key factors preventing media unions in Pakistan accepting the growing number of young journalists, particularly digital and women media practitioners, as members and defending their labour rights. This research also examines how the identified challenges can be tackled to allow for a more dynamic and representative model of union of journalists as a means of strengthening rights of media practitioners in a shifting media landscape.

Methodology

A logical and sequential approach was pursued. This included employing standard survey practices with a pre-determined four distinct categories of respondents to identify challenges as well as group consultations with relevant stakeholders to generate recommendations for solutions. An effort was made to engage institutional stakeholders such as Pakistan Federal Union of Journalists (PFUJ) factions, Digital Media Alliance of Pakistan (DigiMAP), Women Journalists Association (WJA) and key press clubs – representatives of all of whom were part of the baseline survey – allowing generation of representative findings, recommendations and results.

The following sequential approach was followed:

- ◆ Stage 1: Developing survey tools – survey questionnaires
- ◆ Stage 2: Surveys of target categories of respondents
- ◆ Stage 3: Focus group discussion (FGD) with stakeholders for endorsements of findings
- ◆ Stage 4: National advocacy meeting of unions and press clubs to educate them on results



Surveys

This research comprised a series of a total of 60 surveys based on standardised, pre-developed questionnaires, with four distinct categories of respondents representing the broader Pakistani media landscape including both legacy media (print and electronic) and digital media (online journalism platforms). This included:

- ◆ At least 15 young digital journalists – comprising both women and men with around 10 years of service – on journalists' union, media workers' association and press club membership challenges from across all provinces of Pakistan and Islamabad.
- ◆ At least 15 female journalists – working for both digital and non-digital media – on challenges to membership of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs from across all provinces of Pakistan and Islamabad.
- ◆ At least 15 independent, non-legacy media digital journalism platforms facing acceptance challenges to memberships of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press club from across all provinces of Pakistan and Islamabad.
- ◆ At least 15 high-leadership level representatives of different factions of Pakistan Federal Union of Journalists, press clubs and workers' associations from across all provinces of Pakistan and Islamabad.

The following is the sample universe of respondents. The representative nature of each category was ensured through careful selection of respondents within each category including gender, mediums, geography, sub-categories of media workers' groups and their various factions.

Total number of surveys/interviewees (female / male)

#	Gender	Number of Responses	Percentages
01	Male	37	62%
02	Female	23	38%
	Total	60	100%

Number of interviewees in each group (female / male)

	Digital Journalists	Women Journalists	Digital Journalism Platform	Journalists' unions, press clubs, media workers' associations	Total
Male	11	0	12	14	37
Female	04	15	03	01	23
Total	15	15	15	15	60

Data and Analysis

The data from the four distinct categories of respondents above were analysed and collated into distinct challenges to union membership for peer review discussion before a Focus Group. This included challenges that prevent journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs from accepting younger journalists, women journalists and digital journalists as part of the changing journalism practitioners' community into their folds to strengthen labour rights in the Pakistani media industry.

The intended principal objectives of the survey stage of the research was:

1. Individual hurdles: A list of key challenges to union acceptance and membership faced by young journalists – particularly *digital journalists* and *women journalists* identified.
2. Digital' hurdles: A list of key challenges to union acceptance and membership faced by the growing ecosystem of Pakistani *digital journalism platforms* identified.
3. Institutional hurdles: Policies and practices thwarting membership of *journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs*, for young journalists, especially women and digital media, identified.

The following sections – the **first** relating to **problems** of membership of unions faced by the growing body of Pakistan's young journalists, women journalists and digital journalists and the **second** to **solutions** – outline in detail both the datasets and their related sub-findings that are then summarized in key findings.

PROBLEMS

PART -A

PART - A: PROBLEMS

This part of the research report takes a look at key factors preventing media unions – including journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs – in Pakistan accepting the growing number of young journalists, especially digital journalists and women media practitioners, as their members and defending their labour rights?

The following are the key findings based on the data sets resulting from responses to pre-determined questionnaires by four categories of respondents (15 in each category – total 60):

1. **Digital journalists** (comprising both young men and women working for only digital media)
2. **Women journalists** (working for a mix of legacy media and independent, non-legacy digital media platforms)
3. **Digital journalism platforms** (Pakistan-based independent, non-legacy digital journalism platforms representing the emerging ecosystem of professional digital media start-ups)
4. **Media workers groups** (various factions of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and the five largest press clubs in the country based in Islamabad, Karachi, Lahore, Peshawar and Quetta).



CATEGORY 1: DIGITAL JOURNALISTS

– 15 respondents, including both men and women, from across Pakistan and Islamabad.

1 (a). Challenges digital journalists face when seeking membership of unions, press clubs and/or media workers' associations.

- ♦ Six respondents (40%), including three women, said that internet media is generally not considered equal to legacy media.
- ♦ Four respondents (27%), including three women, said that digital journalists are generally not accepted as formal journalists.
- ♦ Three respondents (20%), including two women, said that only those employed with legacy media (TV, radio or newspaper) are preferred for membership.
- ♦ Four respondents (27%), including one woman, said that only those with media employment contracts are generally considered eligible for membership.
- ♦ Two respondents (13%), including one woman, said that generally freelance journalists are not considered eligible for membership.
- ♦ Five respondents (33%), including two women, said that generally charters, constitutions and policies of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations do not consider digital journalists eligible for membership.

Key findings:

1. Digital journalism in Pakistan in general still does not get recognised as part of the general media landscape allowing journalists working only for digital media to be discriminated against for membership of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs.
2. Journalists without contracts from their media employers – whether legacy media or digital media – find it difficult to become members of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs.
3. Charters and constitutions of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs do not reflect current realities of an emerging digital media landscape and its workers.

1 (b). Digital journalists considering themselves eligible for memberships of unions, press clubs and/or media workers' associations.

All 15 (100%) respondents (11 men and 4 women) who were digital journalists said they considered themselves eligible for memberships of journalists' unions, press clubs and/or media workers' associations.

Key findings:

1. All digital journalists consider digital media part of the overall media landscape
2. There is a huge demand within the broader digital media practitioners' community for membership of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs.

1 (c). Measures that can encourage digital journalists acquire membership of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.

Ten respondents (67%), including three women, suggested [broadening definitions](#) of “journalism” and “journalists” to accommodate new realities of internet media and digital journalists.

Nine respondents (60%), including three women, suggested [reforming charters, constitutions, manifestos and policies](#) of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations to accommodate digital journalists.

Eight respondents (53%), including two women, suggested [facilitating dialogue](#) between legacy media (print and electronic media) and digital media (internet media) practitioners on accommodating digital journalists into the fold of existing journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.

Ten respondents (67%), including three women, suggested [reforming rules and criteria of membership](#) to promote inclusivity of all kinds of journalism practitioners in journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.



Key findings:

1. The broader journalists' community in general and the leaderships of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs in particular are not oriented on the technology-driven transformation of the media landscape urgently requiring redefining the concepts of journalism and people who practice it.
2. There is high demand for both a dialogue between practitioners of legacy media and digital media to determine new rules of solidarity and for reforming the outdated and outmoded foundational documents and mission charters of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs that are excluding legacy media journalists making the switch to digital as well as a new crop of journalists that work only for digital media.

CATEGORY 2: WOMEN JOURNALISTS

– 15 respondents, including both legacy and digital media practitioners, from across Pakistan and Islamabad.

2 (a). Challenges women journalists face when seeking membership of unions, press clubs and/or media workers' associations.

- ◆ Four (27%) women journalists said that journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations generally are not proactive in encouraging female journalists to become their members.
- ◆ Four (27%) women journalists said that internet media is generally not considered equal to legacy media and women working for digital media are considered ineligible for membership of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.
- ◆ Six (40%) women journalists said that digital journalists are generally not accepted as formal journalists making women working for digital media ineligible for membership.
- ◆ Eight (53%) women journalists said that only those female journalists employed with legacy media (TV, radio or newspaper) were preferred for membership.
- ◆ Six (40%) women journalists said that only those female journalists with media employment contracts are generally considered eligible for membership.
- ◆ Three (20%) women journalists said that generally, freelance journalists are not considered eligible for membership, therefore female freelance journalists are considered ineligible for membership.
- ◆ Four (27%) women journalists said that generally charters, constitutions and policies of unions, press clubs and media workers' associations are not women-friendly/gender affirmative.



Key findings:

1. Women journalists still face hurdles in becoming members of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations, especially if they have digital journalism-only backgrounds or if they don't have employment contracts.
2. Charters and constitutions of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs tend to be outmoded by being rooted in times that did not reflect the concepts of gender equality and digital media – both of which militate against gender-affirmation and acknowledging and supporting digital media realities.

2 (b). Measures that can encourage women journalists acquire membership of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.

- ◆ Six (40%) women journalists suggested **broadening definitions** of “journalism” and “journalists” to accommodate new realities of internet media and digital journalists.
- ◆ Six (40%) women journalists suggest **reforming charters, constitutions, manifestos and policies** of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations to make them more gender inclusive and women friendly.
- ◆ Seven (47%) women journalists suggested **strengthening groups of women journalists** to expand their influence and collective representation by including women digital media practitioners in their ranks.
- ◆ Five (33%) women journalists suggested **facilitating dialogue** between women's media groups and journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations on expanding their membership of women.
- ◆ Six (40%) women journalists suggested **reforming rules and criteria of membership** for women journalists, including females working for digital media in journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.
- ◆ Six (40%) women journalists suggested **creating special positions** in journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations' office bearers for women journalists, including women digital journalists for elections.

Key findings:

1. There is still considerable room for improvement in the policies and practices of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs to both engender a gender-affirmative environment to encourage greater women journalists' memberships as well as instituting multiple offices within their bodies for women to be elected to them.
2. There is high demand among women journalists and their various platforms for technical resources to improve their skills and strategies to acquire greater representation and influence within journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs.



CATEGORY 3: DIGITAL JOURNALISM PLATFORMS

– 15 respondents, representing a wide array of independent, non-legacy digital media from across Pakistan and Islamabad.

3 (a). Eligibility of digital media in the union world: In a shifting media landscape where technology is changing the nature of media employment and journalism practice, are these new realities acknowledged in policies and practices of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations in Pakistan?

- ♦ All 15 respondents (100%) agreed that in a shifting media landscape where technology is changing the nature of media employment and journalism practice, new realities need to be acknowledged in policies and practices of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations in Pakistan. Of these:
 - Eleven (73%) digital journalism platforms said that digital journalism is also part of professional journalism.
 - Seven (47%) digital journalism platforms said that journalists working for digital media also have workers' rights equivalent to those of legacy media.
 - Eight (53%) digital journalism platforms said that journalists working for digital media have the right to be members of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.
 - Eleven (73%) digital journalism platforms said that digital journalism platforms need to be accepted by the world of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' unions, on a par with other types of media such as print and electronic.

Key findings:

1. There is a high degree of unmet need within the independent digital journalism media community of Pakistan to be mainstreamed into the broader media and media practitioners' communities.
2. There is high interest within the independent digital journalism media community to engage with the community of legacy media (including print and electronic) in a dialogue on solidarity.

3 (b). Absence of digital media workers within structures of unions: In Pakistani media landscape, the numbers of independent digital media (online journalism) platforms are growing. However, their representation in journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations, is not being explicitly accepted. In this context:

- ♦ Eleven (73%) digital journalism platforms said that there should be representation of independent digital media (online journalism) platforms in the ranks of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.
- ♦ Ten (67%) digital journalism platforms urged that there should be acceptability of staffers of independent digital media (online journalism) platforms to become members of journalists' unions, press clubs and media worker associations.

Key findings:

1. Most digital journalism platforms and their workers are keen on becoming members of various journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.

3 (c). Entry barriers for digital media in unions: Key entry barriers to acknowledgement and inclusion of independent digital media (online journalism) platforms in journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.

- ♦ Thirteen (87%) digital journalism platforms said that existing charters / constitution / manifestos of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations are from pre-internet media period and need to be reformed to accommodate new realities of technology-driven journalism.
- ♦ Ten (67%) digital journalism platforms said that current definitions of “journalism” and “journalists” do not represent the changing nature of media landscape and journalism, especially digital media.
- ♦ Thirteen (87%) digital journalism platforms said that a lack of proper debate and institutional / sectoral interface between legacy media and digital media on representation issues and membership matters prevents engagement.



- ♦ Nine (60%) digital journalism platforms said that there is inadequate and ineffective self-organization among digital media platforms.

Key findings:

1. Digital journalism in Pakistan in general still does not get recognised as part of the general media landscape thereby hindering digital journalism platforms engage meaningfully with journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs.
2. The community of digital media and its practitioners lack adequate technical resources and strategies to effectively engage with journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs as partners.

3 (d). Measures to make independent digital media (online journalism) platforms and their journalists / staffers become members of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' association.

- ♦ Eleven (73%) digital journalism platforms urged [amendment to charters](#) of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations to allow membership for digital journalists.
- ♦ Twelve (80%) digital journalism platforms urged [reform of membership rules](#) and regulations / eligibility criteria to [promote diversity and inclusivity of mediums](#) (digital media) and journalism practitioners (digital journalists, including women).
- ♦ Three (20%) digital journalism platforms proposed [creating special positions](#) in journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations' office bearers for digital journalists.

Key findings:

1. There is high desire within the community of digital journalism media platforms to engage with journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations for recognition and membership.

3 (e). How to create greater awareness within the legacy media (print and electronic) and education about independent digital media (online journalism) platforms?

- ♦ Twelve (80%) digital journalism platforms want **orientation on reforming charters and constitutions** of journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations for their leaderships to allow for membership of digital journalists and digital media platforms.
- ♦ Eleven (73%) digital journalism platforms want facilitation of **interactive dialogues** between legacy media practitioners and digital media practitioners.
- ♦ Seven (47%) digital journalism platforms urged **dialogues among factions** of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations to improve unity among journalists' community.
- ♦ Nine (60%) digital journalism platforms urged **trainings** for digital journalists on skills on media rights and representative unionism.
- ♦ Ten (67%) digital journalism platforms asked for **technical support** to Digital Media Alliance of Pakistan (DigiMAP) to improve its capacities and public profile as the principal representative of independent digital media.

Key findings:

1. The digital media community lacks – and wants – resources, skills and opportunities to engage with legacy media practitioners' community to lobby for recognition and eventual memberships within the journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.
2. Digital Media Alliance of Pakistan (DigiMAP) can serve as the representative platform of the country's emerging ecosystem of digital journalists to spearhead a campaign for greater recognition and acceptability within the mainstream media practitioners' community.



CATEGORY 4: JOURNALISTS' UNIONS, MEDIA WORKERS' ASSOCIATIONS & PRESS CLUBS

– 15 respondents, representing different factions of representative platforms of journalists and media workers, from across Pakistan and Islamabad.

Total number of surveys/interviewees (female / male)

Presidents, vice-presidents or secretaries-general of various factions of:	Number
a. Journalists' unions	08
b. Media workers' associations	02
c. Press clubs	05
Total	15

4 (a). Membership eligibility for digital media practitioners: In a shifting media landscape where technology is changing the nature of media employment and journalism practices, do these new realities need to be acknowledged in policies and practices of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations?

All 15 representatives (100%) of various factions of journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations agreed that in a shifting media landscape where technology is changing the nature of media employment and journalism practices, the new realities need to be acknowledged in policies and practices of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.

Of these, however, only:

- ◆ Nine (60%) workers' groups explicitly agreed that digital journalism is also part of professional journalism. These included representatives of 5 journalists' unions, 1 workers' association and 3 press clubs. 40% *did not agree*.
- ◆ Four (27%) workers' groups explicitly agreed that journalists working for digital media have same rights as workers of digital media. All 4 were representatives of journalists' unions. 73% *did not agree*.
- ◆ Five (33%) workers' groups explicitly agreed that journalists working for digital media have the right to be members of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations. Of these 4 represented journalists' unions and 1 press club. 67% *did not agree*.

Key findings:

1. While there is a broad recognition among the journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs of the reality of digital media as being part of the overall media landscape, there is still a great deal of reluctance within them in bringing digital media and its journalists within their folds.

4 (b). Representation of younger journalists, women journalists and digital journalists in the structures of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs: In Pakistani media landscape, digital media (online journalism platforms) and diversity of media practitioners (more women, younger and digital journalists) are growing. However, their representation in journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations is not growing proportionately. In this context, which following statements do you agree with?

Out of 15 representatives of various journalists' unions, media workers' association and press clubs:

- ◆ Twelve (80%) agreed there should be greater representation of *young men and women journalists* in journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations. Of these, 7 represented journalists' unions, 2 workers' associations and 3 press clubs. *20% did not agree.*
- ◆ Six (40%) agreed that there should be greater representation of *digital media journalists* in journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations. Of these, 4 represented journalists' unions, 1 workers' association and 1 press club. *60% did not agree.*
- ◆ Six (40%) agreed that there should be greater representation of *women digital media journalists* in journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations. Of these, 5 represented journalists' associations and 1 press club. *60% did not agree.*

Key findings:

1. There is high support for inclusion of young journalists within the fold of journalists' unions, media workers' association and press clubs as members.
2. There is comparatively lower support for inclusion of both digital journalists and women journalists within the fold of journalists' unions, media workers' association and press clubs as members.



4 (c). Entry barriers for young journalists, women journalists and digital journalists: What are the entry barriers to inclusion of greater numbers of younger, digital and women journalists in journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations?

Out of 15 representatives of various journalists' unions, media workers' association and press clubs:

- ◆ Eight (53%) admitted that their charters / constitutions / manifestos remain un-reformed to accommodate new realities of digital technology-driven journalism era. Of these, 6 represented journalists' unions, 1 workers association and 1 press club.
- ◆ Nine (60%) agreed that definitions of “journalism” and “journalists” have not been re-defined in accordance with changing nature of media landscape and journalism. Of these, 6 represented journalists' unions and 3 press clubs.
- ◆ Two (13%) admitted that there is factionalism and infighting among journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations. Of these one each represented a journalists' union and workers association.
- ◆ Six (40%) agreed that there is a lack of debate among legacy media journalists and digital media journalists on membership and representation issues. Of these, 3 represented journalists' unions, 1 workers' association and 2 press clubs.
- ◆ Three (20%) said that there is inadequate and ineffective self-organization among digital journalists, women journalists and young journalists. Of these, 2 represented journalists' unions and 1 press club.

Key findings:

1. There is wide acknowledgement among media workers' groups that their charters and constitutions are outdated, outmoded and in need of overhaul through reforms.
2. Media workers' groups particularly admit to the gap between legacy media and digital media in terms of the rights of their respective practitioners and that they must engage to new, equitable rules of rights and representation.
3. Media workers' groups admit factionalism within their ranks and can welcome initiatives on greater unity and solidarity.

4 (d). Diversity and inclusivity within the ranks: How can journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations become more representative (more digital journalists) and inclusive (more women journalists) in membership?

Out of 15 representatives of various journalists' unions, media workers' association and press clubs:

- ♦ Eight (53%) suggested **amending charters** of journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations to allow membership for digital journalists. Of these, 7 represented journalists' unions and 1 press clubs.
- ♦ Eleven (73%) suggested **reforming membership rules and regulations / eligibility criteria** to promote diversity and inclusivity of mediums (digital) and journalism practitioners (women and younger journalists). Of these, 7 represented journalists' unions, 1 workers' association and 3 press clubs.
- ♦ Four (27%) suggested **creating special positions** in journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations' office bearers for digital, women and young journalists for elections. Of these, 2 represented journalists' unions and 2 press clubs.

Key findings:

1. There is a high degree of willingness among the journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs on amending their charters and constitutions and to reform membership rules to allow greater inclusivity and diversity in membership.
2. There is tentative willingness among the journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs on creating mandatory representation of young journalists, women journalists and digital journalists through creating of special seats for them in their elective offices.



4 (e). Measures to create greater awareness and education about making journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations in sync with modern era of internet

Out of 15 representatives of various journalists' unions, media workers' association and press clubs:

- ♦ Eight (53%) suggested **orientation sessions on reforming charters and constitutions** of journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations for their leaderships to allow for membership of digital journalists. Of these, 7 represented journalists' associations and 1 workers' association.
- ♦ Ten (67%) suggested **interactive dialogues between legacy media practitioners and digital media practitioners** for greater understanding about each other. Of these, 6 represented journalists' unions, 1 workers' association and 3 press clubs.
- ♦ Four (27%) suggested **dialogues among factions** of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations to improve unity among journalists' community. Of these 2 represented journalists' unions and 2 press clubs.
- ♦ Eight (53%) suggested **training digital journalists, women journalists and young journalists** on skills on media rights and representative unionism. Of these, 6 represented journalists' unions and 2 press clubs.

Key findings:

1. There is a high degree of willingness among the journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs to engage with all excluded principals within the media workers' communities and to build capacities and partnerships to draft and implement a charter of membership reform and greater media worker solidarity.

PART -B

SOLUTIONS

PART - B: SOLUTIONS

How can the challenges outlined in the findings of this research report in Part A be tackled to allow for a more dynamic and representative model of representative associations of media workers – such as journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations – in Pakistan as a means of strengthening the rights of media practitioners in a shifting media landscape?

Based on the primary data analysis outlined in detail in the Part A of this research report, a representative distillation of the recommendations made by the four distinct categories of respondents – digital journalists, women journalists, digital media platforms and journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations – are presented here as key remedial actions to tackle the challenges of inclusive unionism and representative reforms. The proposed supportive actions in aid of each of the following recommendations come from detailed consolidated inputs from all four categories of respondents through an online consultation meeting held in July 2021:



RECOMMENDATION 1: INCLUSIVE DEFINITIONS:

Help broaden the understanding of modern definitions of key phrases “journalism” and “journalists” to accommodate new realities of internet media and digital journalists *(supported by 60% digital journalists + 40% women journalists under this research).*

Possible supportive actions in aid of this recommendation:

Conduct **sensitization sessions** for the four categories of respondents – preferably through common participation of representatives of these categories – on the changing nature of the media landscape and the shifting roles of all categories of persons engaged in the profession of journalism. The inclusive definitions of 'journalists,' and 'journalism' proposed by Unesco can be offered as guidelines and encouraged as new definitional benchmarks. Where possible the journalism and mass communication departments – specifically the 'journalists of tomorrow' – should also be included in the process.

RECOMMENDATION 2: REFORM CHARTERS & CONSTITUTIONS:

Help reform charters, constitutions, manifestos and policies of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations to accommodate into their fold digital journalists *(supported by 60% digital journalists + 73% digital journalism platforms under this research).*

Possible supportive actions in aid of this recommendation:

- ♦ National and provincial level **seminars** for journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations on the need for and **generating consensus on modernizing their charters and constitutions** rooted in a pre-internet, pre-real time media age.
- ♦ Training **workshops** for leaderships of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations **on reviewing and reforming their charters, constitutions, manifestos and policies** based on best practices and new realities of digital media.

RECOMMENDATION 3:

LEGACY-DIGITAL MEDIA INTERFACING:

Facilitate dialogue between legacy media (print and electronic media) and digital media (internet media) practitioners on:

- 1 Sustainable **engagement** between workers of legacy media and digital media (*supported 67% journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations*).
- 2 **Accommodation** of digital journalists as members into the fold of existing journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations (*supported by 53% digital journalists*).
- 3 Expanding **membership** of women journalists (*supported by 33% women journalists*).
- 4 **Acknowledging** digital journalism platforms and their staff as part of the community of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations (*supported by 73% digital journalism platforms*).

Possible supportive actions in aid of this recommendation:

National and provincial level **dialogues**— starting with provincial and moving up to federal level – for representative groups of legacy media and digital media practitioners on **determining common ground on rights and representation** of all categories of media and journalism practitioners.

Development of a **common charter of reforms for diversity and inclusivity** in representation of media practitioners within journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations. Involve district and provincial levels unions and press clubs in the process. This [document] can lead to the enactment of the next recommendation.



RECOMMENDATION 4: REFORM MEMBERSHIP CRITERIA:

Reforming rules and criteria of membership of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations to promote inclusivity of all kinds of journalism practitioners, including:

- 1 **Inclusivity** of all kinds of journalism practitioners, including digital journalists *(supported by 67% digital journalists + 53% journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations).*
- 2 Making them more gender inclusive and **women friendly** *(supported by 40% women journalists).*
- 3 **Membership for more women** journalists, including females working for digital media *(supported by 40% women journalists).*
- 4 Promote **diversity and inclusivity of mediums** (digital media) and journalism practitioners (digital journalists, including women and younger journalists) – *supported by 80% digital journalism platforms + 73% journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.*

Possible supportive actions in aid of this recommendation:

- ◆ Conduct an independent **technical review** of the charters and manifestos of all the key factions of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs to **identify areas/provisions of reforms.**
- ◆ Conduct a series of **sensitization sessions** for journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs on the **outcomes of the technical review** and facilitate its endorsement.
- ◆ Support **leadership meetings** of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs on formally **reforming/amending their charters** and manifestos based on the endorsements.

RECOMMENDATION 5:

AFFIRMATIVE ACTION - SPECIAL DIVERSITY POSTS:

Creating special positions in journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations' office bearers for:

- 1 **Digital journalists** (*supported by 100% digital journalists + 20% digital journalism platforms + 27% journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations*)
- 2 **Women journalists** (*supported by 40% digital journalists + 27% journalists' unions, press clubs and workers' associations*)

Possible supportive actions in aid of this recommendation:

- ♦ **Identify champions** and **create an alliance** to press for special positions including existing journalists' and media related groups – Journalists' Defence Committee (JDC), Alliance on Diversity and Pluralism in Media (ADPM), Pakistan Journalists' Safety Coalition (PJSC), etc.
- ♦ **Supportive actions** on this recommendation can be **accommodated in supportive actions outlined in all four recommendations above.**



RECOMMENDATION 6: STRENGTHENING ADVOCACY CAPACITIES:

Strengthening groups of digital journalists, women journalists and digital journalism platforms to expand their influence and collective representation in journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations – supported by 100% digital journalists + 47% women journalists + 80% digital journalism practitioners under this research, through:

- 1 **Trainings for digital journalists on advocacy for greater rights** within journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations – supported by 53% journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations + 60% digital journalism platforms.
- 2
- 3 **Trainings for women journalists on advocacy for greater rights** within journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations – supported by 53% journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.
- 4 **Technical support** to Digital Media Alliance of Pakistan (DigiMAP) for **advocacy on representative unionism** – supported by 67% digital journalism platforms.
- 5 **Trainings on reforming charters** of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations for their leadership – supported by 53% journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations for their leadership + 80% digital media platforms.

Possible supportive actions in aid of this recommendation:

- ◆ Conduct separate series of **trainings for women and young digital journalists** at the national and provincial levels on effective advocacy on representation of their rights within journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs.
- ◆ Support women and young digital journalists to produce and implement **advocacy strategies**.
- ◆ Support Digital Media Alliance of Pakistan (DigiMAP) to produce their own charter on rights of workers, including women and digital journalists and strategies on engaging journalist's unions media workers' associations and press clubs on **accommodating digital journalism platforms within the media workers' communities**.

RECOMMENDATION 7:

UNITY & SOLIDARITY DIALOGUES:

Facilitating dialogues among factions of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations to improve and strengthen unity among journalists' community
– supported by 27% journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations + 47% digital journalism platforms under this research.

- 1 **Trainings for digital journalists** on **advocacy for greater rights** within journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations – supported by 53% journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations + 60% digital journalism platforms.
- 2
- 3 **Trainings for women journalists** on **advocacy for greater rights** within journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations – supported by 53% journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations.
- 4 **Technical support** to Digital Media Alliance of Pakistan (DigiMAP) for **advocacy on representative unionism** – supported by 67% digital journalism platforms.
- 5 **Trainings** on **reforming charters** of journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations for their leadership – supported by 53% journalists' unions, press clubs and media workers' associations for their leadership + 80% digital media platforms.

Possible supportive actions in aid of this recommendation:

- ♦ Facilitate a series of **dialogues**, at the district, provincial and national levels, for various factions of journalists' unions, media workers' associations and press clubs on **identifying common grounds of engagement and common strategies** – especially around advocacy for legislation on safety of journalists, defence of media workers' rights in courts, resisting censorship and building alliances with civil society.